

Challenge Definition Workshop Report

Identifying and collectively agreeing the traffic and congestion related issues in Broadclyst

Background

In December 2017, Exeter City Futures was invited by the campaign group Slow Broadclyst to help them understand the traffic and congestion challenges in Broadclyst and consider potential solutions with the community.

Slow Broadclyst shared the various strategies they have explored within Broadclyst specifically with these named stakeholders: Primary School, Devon County Council, East Devon District Council and other local community groups. They also outlined their ambitions to work with all organisations, community groups and stakeholders who work in Broadclyst to build solutions to congestion and promote sustainable travel through the village.

It was agreed that Exeter City Futures would be invited to engage community groups and stakeholders via initial listening workshops, with the aim to foster and encourage a collectively self-identified understanding of the transport issues that can be articulated as agreed challenges.

Exeter City Futures Contribution to Change

At our core, Exeter City Futures offers a process for defining problems, building partnerships to find solutions, and managing and measuring progress. We are working to bring City organisations (business and community) together in order to harness individual effort, create shared responsibility for delivering the Goals and bring coordination and focus to the challenges we face. Our innovation process guides individuals and community leaders through a series of defined steps that support them to:

- Conduct listening and engagement activities to identify the perceived root issue(s) within their community.
- Collect and share data to understand the causes and impact of perceived root issues and define clear challenges to be addressed.
- Identify pathways to solutions co-created by the community that reflect their own priorities and create change for themselves. These pathways might include:
 - Clear articulation/framing of the challenge and acceptable outcomes that can be used to enter a dialogue with local council;
 - Campaign(s) to highlight the need for long-term behavioural change;
 - Crowdfunding/sourcing-exchange platforms to raise financial support to develop solutions and mobilise community support for change;
 - Engagement with entrepreneurs and innovators to co-design and select solutions that meet local need; and

- Support to build sustainable, community-led solutions.



The Exeter City Futures Innovation process has its foundations in change management. Change can be uncomfortable for many people and the level of systematic change necessary to deliver our Goals will rely on engaged communities and environments that help develop the right solutions to meet local need.

In order to collectively work towards defining the right solutions it is important for the community to be ready to make change. By this we mean that the community must have a common view on their vision for the future, must accept that the current situation is not viable and must be prepared to approach the task in a way that is open to all ideas and solutions.

Exeter City Futures Innovation Approach with Broadclyst Community and Stakeholders

Step 1 - Listen and Analyse

Throughout 2018-2019, Exeter City Futures held listening activities with various stakeholders and community groups to listen to and gather 'lived experience' data of the congestion and traffic related problems. At the listening engagements participants were encouraged to share what they loved about Broadclyst and what they felt were the problems relating to traffic and congestion. The listening activities included the use of large printed maps of Broadclyst and workshop participants were encouraged to draw or write comments on the map, on post it notes, on Problem Definition cards or add stickers to represent the issues within certain geographical areas.

Listening Engagements were led by Kerry Deacon a Global City Futures consultant on behalf of Exeter City Futures, with support and guidance from Liz O'Driscoll Programme Director at Exeter City Futures. Liz Shaw from Slow Broadclyst would often broker the relationship with community stakeholders within Broadclyst.

Analysis



Figure 1 is a word cloud image created from inputting all the collated comments from the listening engagements facilitated within Broadclyst. The largest words represent those most often written as statements of traffic and congestion issues or problems perceived within the village.

Below are statement examples from the listening engagements:

"Sometimes the public car park is full and then you have to search for a parking space. Unfortunately you then end up parked outside someone's house."

"The parking is difficult at certain times of day. The village car park is always full during school term days."

"Parking on the main road (B3181) which causes difficulties with access to the village."

"Heavy traffic congestion in Hellings Gardens and Town Hill at beginning and end of school day."

"Double yellow lines not enforced at Doctors."

"Emergency vehicles cannot get through to Hellings and Town Hill because of parking on junction of Town Hill/ B3181."

"Station Road access from Cranbrook direction builds up due to lorries there and large vehicles."
"B3181 – the hill into the village could do with some kind of speed restriction – especially as the bottom of the hill is a crossing."

"I arrive by 7.30 in the morning – there is rarely a space at school – have to park in the village."

"Congestion leaving school at 8.30 is busy."

"Cars parked on main road causes congestion along the road."

The listening activities were held with Broadclyst Parish Council, Broadclyst Primary School teachers and teaching assistants, users of Victory Hall and Slow Broadclyst. The Pinhoe and Broadclyst Medical Practice conducted a survey with its patients and staff, receiving 43 completed responses. Other community groups were in discussion to be engaged with, but unfortunately, due to varying reasons, were not able to be held and completed. Yet, the engagement yielded 206 comments and statements reflecting perceived challenges with traffic and congestion in the village.

A geographical analysis of the statements received during the listening exercises resulted in all statements being grouped under one of eight geographies:

- Town Hill
- Car Park
- B3181
- Surgery/Hellings Gardens
- Primary School
- Station Road
- Pavilion Car Park
- Blackhorse

Those comments and statements that fell out of a geographical analysis, resulted in being grouped under one of four themes:

- Behavioural Assumptions
- Public Transport
- Solutions
- Miscellaneous

Step 2 - Define the Challenge

A challenge definition workshop was facilitated by Exeter City Futures on 11th March 2019.

The aim and purpose of the challenge definition workshop was to bring all community groups and stakeholders together in a neutrally facilitated environment to;

- Unpack the feedback received from the listening engagement
- Explore existing ideas around transport and congestion challenges
- Collectively agree and articulate the challenges that Broadclyst face

The workshop attendees were:

Liz O'Driscoll: Programme Director, Exeter City Futures

Kerry Deacon: Consultant Project Manager, Global City Futures

Gauri Kangai: Nurture Programme Manager, Exeter Velocities

Simon Bates: Green Infrastructure Project Manager, East Devon County Council

Councillor Henry Gent: Chair of Traffic and Comms Committee, Broadclyst Parish Council

Natasha Curwood: Deputy Clerk Broadclyst Parish Council

Zsolt Schuller: Independent Transport Planner

Liz Shaw: Co-founder Slow Broadclyst

Karl Shaw: Co-founder Slow Broadclyst

David James: Head of Education Broadclyst Primary School, Cornerstone Academy Trust

Jonathan Bishop: Headteacher Broadclyst Primary School, Cornerstone Academy Trust

Other stakeholders invited but not in attendance included:

Victory Hall

National Trust

Office of the Police and Crime Commissioner

Devon County Council

Clyst Caring Friends

The structure of the challenge definition workshop was devised around three key areas:

Exploring Challenges

- Define the problems as a group and choose two/three top challenges as priorities to explore

Exploring Solutions

- Collaborate in groups to map out some possible solutions to challenges identified
- Choose one challenge to take forward as a community

Exploring next steps

- Consider the roles and resources to mobilise the solution(s) you've identified
- How you as a community can take this forward and use this process in the traffic clinics?
- Check in and feedback on this workshop process

Exploring Challenges

Kerry Deacon shared the anecdotal and perceived lived experience data collected through the listening activities within Broadclyst, (please see **Analysis** section above) and presented a collection of national 'pop' up and community action based projects that are tackling congestion and traffic problems. Please see a curated list of the presented projects below:

Figure 2 is an image of all traffic problems collected from participants through the mapping exercise.

Below are the statements and comments written from all attendees, collectively mapping the challenges across Broadclyst.

Generated > higher house prices. Anecdotally 'great place to move to'	Drop Off Zone (pedestrian) 8.30 100 cars	Pavilion car park full
Lowered social mix > affluent catchment	Grid Lock – Queue four times/week	Blocked Turning into residential road
1 st to acadamise, opp for school, > individual autonomy	Tues and Thurs April – Sept	Unable to park close to surgery
Teaching school teachers	Blocks driveways, careless parking and move	Inappropriate Parking on B3181
English Hub	PM worst, cannot come home. 1 hour lost waiting	Quality of education
Secondary school	Where are people travelling from 20% response rate	individual autonomy offer opportunities (Families edu/culture)
50mph road	Public Transport good stop outside house. Not often, too cumbersome journey	Briefings with school teachers and parents on etiquette semi-effective
Broadclyst School	Car sharing, flows work, where from, Routes don't match. Safeguarding. Clash of schedules	Insufficient parking at school for staff
No safe cycle route. Pinhoe?	Need for wrap around care/case 15 hrs – 30 hrs, 40 phase nursery	Weekly fluctuating in where travel from + why
Outstanding school, popular, High intake 25yrs: 250 – 450 440 including nursery	Clyst Vale unsafe lorries	Cycle path stops
Pinhoe to BC too long	Shared footpath not wide enough	Cyclist on back path – no prob

Residents Noise Feels lack of privacy Air quality Air pollution (Town Hill) 500 users x 2/day	8.45- 9.15 – lunch rush 12pm, nursery 2.45, 3.45, 5.00	Traffic pollution from cars @ 8.00- 9.45 @ 14.30 - 18.00
---	--	--

The mapping statements fuelled engaged discussions to understand and explore the various reasons for the problems, from all perspectives of stakeholders.

The discussion resulted in a set of top challenges Broadclyst is facing. These were determined as:

1. Too many people are driving into the village
2. Lack of respect and parking etiquette
3. B3181 junction at Town Hill grid lock and drop off
4. No safe footpaths / cycle ways not perceived safe
5. More sustainable transport for further out
6. Lack of support framework

Two challenges, identified through dot voting, were taken forward by the workshop attendees to start to consider and explore possible solutions.

Challenge 1: Too many people are driving into the village

Challenge 2: Lack of support framework to report, monitor and reduce congestion

Step 3 - Access Innovation

Through discussion and Design Thinking tasks, in two groups, attendees identified a range of possible solutions:

Challenge 1: Too many people are driving into the village

- Design a survey monkey covering the residents of Broadclyst and the school to collect data on journeys in Broadclyst A → B → C
- Close Town Hill as a one off event and turn it into a play street for the day, including measuring the knock on effect of the event within the community, car parking capacity and area
- Rent a field for the day (local farmer or National Trust) and host a Park and Stride as an alternative place to park and plan to measure effect
- Devise two campaigns in collaboration with the school to encourage more active/ alternative transport

- Create awareness signs between the community and pupils and display throughout the village

Challenge 2: Lack of support framework to report, monitor and reduce congestion

- Temporary try out of parking restrictions using pop up yellow lines, meters of gold ribbon coupled with the school ticketing flyers made and issued by pupils
- Devise an online reporting mechanism and build evidence
- Variable enforcement of parking e.g. double yellow lines restrictions for the afternoon
- Community volunteering - is there a community volunteering scheme to support the school at Drop and Pick-up
- Create a collaborative community and school children code of conduct of the road and encourage residents and school to sign up

Summary and Recommendations

The Challenge Definition Workshop offered a neutral space to come together. It was positive to see gathered stakeholders committing to the Challenge Definition Workshop to continue the discussion around the challenges, and collectively frame the problem in a neutral and facilitated space.

It is clear that the community has a high level of frustration experiencing similar and different traffic and congestion problems. Our observations led us to consider how ready as a community is Broadclyst to take change forward. There is a lack of agreement on long term aspirations for the village which will make it difficult to develop solutions that are acceptable for all. Conflict remains between critical parties and there is not yet an agreed common goal that suits all. This is a barrier to moving forwards in the innovation process within Step 3 which means there would not be progression to move to Step 4 - Validate and Share learning.

To be ready for and to create change we suggest that Broadclyst needs to determine what a baseline of good would look like for all. A recognition of and a willingness to compromise will be needed to make long lasting sustainable change happen for all who live, work and are educated within Broadclyst. If all stakeholders can make and agree the compromise, then perhaps collaboration and cooperation can be developed so that change can be moved forward.

As a result of the engagement and challenge definition activities conducted with the group, Exeter City Futures offers a number of recommendations for the Community to consider:

1. The Community should commit to a thorough data collection exercise to understand the challenges and to evidence the traffic problems, alongside developing evidence based (data) skills to support and measure any pop-up or temporary interventions.
Data collection examples:
 - Traffic speed on the B3181
 - Capacity and use of the main village car park
 - Understanding of local businesses perception on the traffic within Broadclyst
 - Parent and school staff travel behaviour and distances
 - Capacity and use of the local bus route
 - Capacity and use of the cycle lane
 - Student active transport modes to Clyst Vale Community College and appropriate safety
2. The community should consider creating a set of proposals for temporary pop-up approaches, campaigning, funding research. Proposals should be delivered with a collaborative approach by all members between the parish council, community, residents, business and the school. This will ensure that there is real ownership to create and effect change. (Initial project ideas identified in the Challenge Definition Workshop **Exploring Solutions**).
3. Appoint a community volunteer with support from the Parish Council to start to consider the roles, resources, and mobilisation of data collection or temporary pop-up projects and coordinate stakeholders to deliver them collaboratively.
4. Consider maintaining the Traffic Clinics after this current school year. Perhaps they can be transferred and be owned by the Parish Council. We suggest that there should be a shift and change in the focus of the Traffic Clinics and move away from reporting problems to a space of working together to initiate change. The Traffic Clinics offer a 'room' where, if collaboration can be fostered, interventions, events and campaigns can be planned together, and be a tangible point of engagement to invite and court more stakeholders and potential funders.
5. Design a clear code of conduct agreed by all parties on the etiquette around using social media when developing, delivering and evaluating projects and initiatives.

Potential Funding sources

Sustrans have curated a potential funding list to develop sustainable travel street designs:

https://www.sustrans.org.uk/sites/default/files/file_content_type/guide_local_funding_sources_sustainable_travel_street_design_projects.pdf